west virginia department of environmental protection

Division of Water and Waste Management
601 57th Street SE
Charleston, WV 25304
Phone: (304) 926-0495
Fax: (304) 926-0463

Earl Ray Tomblin, Governor
Randy C. Huffman, Cabinet Secretary
www.dep.wv.gov

CONSENT ORDER
ISSUED UNDER THE
WATER POLLUTION CONTROL ACT
WEST VIRGINIA CODE, CHAPTER 22, ARTICLE 11

TO: AFP Log and Lumber, LLC
ATTN: Stephanie Cutright
PO Box 2228
Buckhannon, WV 26201

DATE: August 29, 2012

ORDER NO.: 7346

INTRODUCTION

This Consent Order is issued by the Director of the Division of Water and Waste Management (hereinafter "Director"), under the authority of West Virginia Code, Chapter 22, Article 11, Section 1 et seq. to AFP Log and Lumber, LLC (hereinafter "AFP").

FINDINGS OF FACT

In support of this Order, the Director hereby finds the following:

1. AFP operates a facility located in Buckhannon, Upshur County, West Virginia. AFP was issued WV/NPDES Water Pollution Control Permit No. WV0111457, Registration No. WVG611271 on November 16, 2006. Said registration expired on September 30, 2009.

2. Establishments with discharges composed entirely of stormwater associated with industrial activities must obtain a permit from the West Virginia Department of Environmental Protection (WVDEP) pursuant to §22-11-8 of the State Code of West Virginia and as described in Legislative Rule Title 47, Series 10.

3. WVDEP advised AFP in mid-2009, early -2010, and January 2011 to reapply for permit registration coverage under the Multi-Sector General WV/NPDES Water Pollution Control Permit for Stormwater Discharges Associated with Industrial Activity.

4. AFP failed to renew its WV/NPDES permit registration.

5. On May 2, 2012, coverage for the aforementioned facility was re-established by Three Cees, LLC under WV/NPDES Water Pollution Control Permit No. WV0111457, Registration No. WVG611573.

6. On July 30, 2012, WVDEP personnel and representatives of AFP met to discuss the terms and conditions of this Order.

ORDER FOR COMPLIANCE

Now, therefore, in accordance with Chapter 22, Article 11, Section 1 et seq. of the West Virginia Code, it is hereby agreed between the parties, and ORDERED by the Director:

1. AFP shall immediately take all measures to initiate compliance with all pertinent laws and rules.

2. Because of AFP's West Virginia Code violations, AFP shall be assessed a civil administrative penalty of two thousand thirty dollars ($2,030) to be paid to the West Virginia Department of Environmental Protection for deposit in the Water Quality Management Fund within thirty (30) days of entry of this Order. Payments made pursuant to this paragraph are not tax-deductible for purposes of State or federal law. **Payment shall be mailed to:**

Chief Inspector
Environmental Enforcement - Mail Code #031328
WV-DEP
601 57th Street SE
Charleston, WV 25304

OTHER PROVISIONS

1. AFP hereby waives its right to appeal this Order under the provisions of Chapter 22, Article 11, Section 21 of the Code of West Virginia. Under this Order, AFP agrees to take all actions required by the terms and conditions of this Order and consents to and will not contest the Director's jurisdiction regarding this Order. However, AFP does not admit to any factual and legal determinations made by the Director and reserves all rights and defenses available regarding liability or responsibility in any proceedings regarding AFP other than proceedings, administrative or civil, to enforce this Order.

2. The Director reserves the right to take further action if compliance with the terms and conditions of this Order does not adequately address the violations noted herein and reserves all rights and defenses which he may have pursuant to any legal authority, as well as the right to raise, as a basis for supporting such legal authority or defenses, facts other than those contained in the Findings of Fact.

RECEIVED
SEP - 6 2012
ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

3. If any event occurs which causes delay in the achievement of the requirements of this Order, AFP shall have the burden of proving that the delay was caused by circumstances beyond its reasonable control which could not have been overcome by due *diligence (i.e.,* force majeure). Force majeure shall not include delays caused or contributed to by the lack of sufficient funding. Within three (3) working days after AFP becomes aware of such a delay, notification shall be provided to the Director/Chief Inspector and shall, within ten (10) working days of initial notification, submit a detailed written explanation of the anticipated length and cause of the delay, the measures taken and/or to be taken to prevent or minimize the delay, and a timetable by which AFP intends to implement these measures. If the Director agrees that the delay has been or will be caused by circumstances beyond the reasonable control of AFP (i.e., force majeure), the time for performance hereunder shall be extended for a period of time equal to the delay resulting from such circumstances. A force majeure amendment granted by the Director shall be considered a binding extension of this Order and of the requirements herein. The determination of the Director shall be final and not subject to appeal.

4. Compliance with the terms and conditions of this Order shall not in any way be construed as relieving AFP of the obligation to comply with any applicable law, permit, other order, or any other requirement otherwise applicable. Violations of the terms and conditions of this Order may subject AFP to additional penalties and injunctive relief in accordance with the applicable law.

5. The provisions of this Order are severable and should a court or board of competent jurisdiction declare any provisions to be invalid or unenforceable, all other provisions shall remain in full force and effect.

6. This Order is binding on AFP, its successors and assigns.

7. This Order shall terminate upon AFP's notification of full compliance with the "Order for Compliance" and verification of this notification by WVDEP.

Stephanie Cutright
AFP Log and Lumber, LLC

9/4/2012
Date

Public Notice begin: _____
Date

Public Notice end: _____
Date

_____
Scott G. Mandirola, Director
Division of Water and Waste Management

_____
Date

Base Penalty Calculation

(pursuant to 47CSR1-6.1)

Responsible Party: AFP Log and Lumber, LLC **Receiving Stream:** Mud Lick to Fink Run

Treatment System Design Maximum Flow: 0.023 **MGD**

Treatment System Actual Average Flow: _____ **MGD** (if known)

Enter FOF# and rate each finding as to Potential and Extent.

1)	Potential for Harm Factor	Factor Range	FOF#												
			4												
a)	Amount of Pollutant Released	1 to 3	1												
b)	Toxicity of Pollutant	0 to 3	1												
c)	Sensitivity of the Environment	0 to 3	1												
d)	Length of Time	1 to 3	1												
e)	Actual Exposure and Effects thereon	0 to 3	1												
	Average Potential for Harm Factor		1	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2)	**Extent of Deviation Factor**	**Factor Range**													
	Degree of Non-Compliance	1 to 3	3												

Potential for Harm Factors:

1)c - Sensitivity of the Environment Potentially Affected (0 for "dead" stream)

1)d - Length of Time of Violation

1)e - Actual Human/Environmental Exposure and Resulting Effects thereon

Examples/Guidance:

Note: Rate as 1 for Minor, 2 for Moderate and 3 for Major. Rate as 0 if it does not apply.

Minor = exceedance of permit limit by <=40% for Avg. Monthly or <=100% for Daily Max., exceed numeric WQ standard by <= 100%, or report doesn't contain some minor information.

Moderate = exceedance of permit limit by >= 41% and <= 300% for Avg. Monthly , >= 101% and <= 600% for Daily Max., exceed numeric WQ standard by >= 101% and <= of 600% or report doesn't fully address intended subject matter.

Major = exceedance of permit limit by >= 301% for Avg. Monthly, >= 601% for Daily Max., exceed numeric WQ standard by >= 601%, failure to submit a report, failure to obtain a permit, failure to report a spill, etc. Note that a facility in SNC should be rated as major for length of time and degree of non-compliance.

Narrative WQ standard violations - case-by-case.

Continue rating Findings of Facts (FOF) here, if necessary. Otherwise, continue on Page 3.

1)	Potential for Harm Factor	Factor Range	FOF#												
a)	Amount of Pollutant Released	1 to 3													
b)	Toxicity of Pollutant	0 to 3													
c)	Sensitivity of the Environment	0 to 3													
d)	Length of Time	1 to 3													
e)	Actual Exposure and Effects thereon	0 to 3													
	Average Potential for Harm Factor		No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
2)	**Extent of Deviation Factor**	**Factor Range**													
	Degree of Non-Compliance	1 to 3													

		Extent of Deviation from Requirement		
		Major	Moderate	Minor
Potential for Harm to Human Health or the Environment	Major	$8,000 to $10,000	$6,000 to $8,000	$5,000 to $6,000
	Moderate	$4,000 to $5,000	$3,000 to $4,000	$2,000 to $3,000
	Minor	$1,500 to $2,000	$1,000 to $1,500	Up to $1,000

FOF #	Potential for Harm	Extent of Deviation	Penalty	Multiple Factor	Base Penalty
4	Minor	Major	$2,000	1	$2,000
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
0	FALSE	FALSE	FALSE	1	$0
Total Base Penalty					$2,000

Penalty Adjustment Factors

(pursuant to 47CSR1-6.2)

Penalty Adjustment Factor

6.2.b.1 - Degree of or absence of willfulness and/or negligence - 0% to 30% increase
6.2.b.4 - Previous compliance/noncompliance history - 0% to 100% increase - based upon review of last three (3) years - Warning = maximum of 5% each, N.O.V. = maximum of 10% each, previous Order = maximum of 25% each - Consistent DMR violations for <1 year = 10% maximum, for >1 year but <2 years = 20% maximum, for >2 years but <3 years = 30% maximum, for >3 years = 40 % maximum

6.2.b.6 - Economic benefits derived by the responsible party (increase to be determined)

6.2.b.7 - Public Interest (increase to be determined)

6.2.b.8 - Loss of enjoyment of the environment (increase to be determined)

6.2.b.9 - Staff investigative costs (increase to be determined)
6.2.b.10 - Other factors

Size of Violator: 0 - 50% decrease

NOTE: This factor is not available to discharges that are causing a water quality violation. This factor does not apply to a commercial or industrial facility that employees or is part of a corporation that employees more than 100 individuals.

Avg. Daily WW Discharge Flow (gpd)	% Reduction Factor
< 5,000	50
5,000 to 9,999	40
10,000 to 19,999	30
20,000 to 29,999	20
30,000 to 39,999	10
40,000 to 99,999	5
> 100,000	0

Additional Other factors to be determined for increases or decreases on a case-by-case basis.

Public Notice Costs (cost for newspaper advertisement)
6.2.b.2 - Good Faith - 10% decrease to 10% increase
6.2.b.3 - Cooperation with the Secretary - 0% to 10% decrease
6.2.b.5 - Ability to pay a civil penalty - 0% to 100% decrease

Base Penalty Adjustments

(pursuant to 47CSR1-6.2)

Penalty Adjustment Factor	% Increase	% Decrease	Base Penalty Adjustments
6.2.b.1 - Willfulness and/or negligence -			$0
6.2.b.4 - Compliance/noncompliance history			$0
6.2.b.6 - Economic benefits - (flat monetary increase)			$0
6.2.b.7 - Public Interest - (flat monetary increase)			$0
6.2.b.8 - Loss of enjoyment - (flat monetary increase)			$0
6.2.b.9 - Investigative costs - (flat monetary increase)			$0
6.2.b.10 - Other factors (size of violator)			$0
6.2.b.10 - Additional Other Factors - Increase (flat monetary increase)			$0
6.2.b.10 - Additional Other Factors - Decrease (flat monetary decrease)			$0
Public Notice Costs (flat monetary increase)	$30		$30
6.2.b.2 - Good Faith - Increase			$0
6.2.b.2 - Good Faith - Decrease			$0
6.2.b.3 - Cooperation with the Secretary			$0
6.2.b.5 - Ability to Pay			$0
Penalty Adjustments			**$30**
Penalty =			**$2,030**

Estimated Economic Benefit Item	Estimated Benefit ($)
Monitoring & Reporting	
Installation & Maintenance of Pollution Control Equipment	
O&M expenses and cost of equipment/materials needed for compliance	
Permit Application or Modification	
Competitive Advantage	
Estimated Economic Benefit	**$0**
Comments:	