



west virginia department of environmental protection

Division of Water and Waste Management
601 57th Street SE
Charleston, WV 25304
Phone: (304) 926-0470
Fax: (304) 926-0488

Earl Ray Tomblin, Governor
Randy C. Huffman, Cabinet Secretary
www.dep.wv.gov

**CONSENT ORDER
ISSUED UNDER THE
WATER POLLUTION CONTROL ACT
WEST VIRGINIA CODE, CHAPTER 22, ARTICLE 11**

TO: Cheat Road, LLC.
Attn: David Biafora
6200 Mid Atlantic Drive
Morgantown, WV 26508

DATE: January 14, 2015

ORDER NO.: 8226

INTRODUCTION

This Consent Order is issued by the Director of the Division of Water and Waste Management (hereinafter "Director"), under the authority of West Virginia Code, Chapter 22, Article 11, Section 1 et seq. to Cheat Road, LLC. (hereinafter "Cheat Road").

FINDINGS OF FACT

In support of this Order, the Director hereby finds the following:

1. Cheat Road is conducting land disturbance activity in Morgantown, Monongalia County, West Virginia. On June 16, 2006, Cheat Road was issued WV/NPDES Water Pollution Control Permit No. WV0115924, Registration No. WVR102302. The WV/NPDES permit was administratively extended to September 30, 2013.
2. On October 1, 2014, West Virginia Department of Environmental Protection (WVDEP) personnel conducted an inspection of the facility. During the inspection, it was observed that Cheat Road had not initiated stabilization measures, such as seed and mulch, on portions of the site where construction activities had temporarily or permanently ceased for greater than seven (>7) days and did not resume within fourteen (14) days. In addition, it was observed that Cheat Road had not developed a maintenance plan or provided that all erosion controls on the site were inspected at least once every seven (7) calendar days and within twenty-four (24) hours after any storm event of greater than 0.5 inches of rain per twenty-four (24) hour period. Cheat Road also failed to install several erosion and sediment control devices (i.e. Sediment Ponds One and Two) as detailed in

its approved Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP). The SWPPP had not been modified when there was a change in design, construction, scope of operation, or maintenance, which had a significant effect on the potential for the discharge of pollutants to waters of the State, or the SWPPP proved to be ineffective in achieving the general objectives of controlling pollutants in storm water discharges. Specifically, the site layout did not allow for the installation or proper functioning of Sediment Ponds One and Two, thus necessitating a modification of the SWPPP. During the inspection, the following violation of WV Legislative Rules was documented:

- a. 47CSR2 Section 3.2.a-Cheat Road caused conditions not allowable in waters of the State by creating distinctly visible settleable solids in the stream. Sediment deposits and boulders originating from the site were in the stream channel.

As a result of the aforementioned violation, Notice of Violation (NOV) No. W-NW-TWH-100114-003 was issued to Cheat Road.

3. On January 2, 2015, WVDEP personnel performed a records review and observed the following violation of WV Legislative Rules:
 - a. 47CSR10 Section 5.2 - Cheat Road failed to reapply for permit coverage under the aforementioned WV/NPDES General Water Pollution Control Permit at least 180 days prior to expiration of its permit on September 30, 2013.

ORDER FOR COMPLIANCE

Now, therefore, in accordance with Chapter 22, Article 11, Section 1 et seq. of the West Virginia Code, it is hereby agreed between the parties, and ORDERED by the Director:

1. Cheat Road shall immediately take all measures to initiate compliance with all terms and conditions of its WV/NPDES permit and pertinent laws and rules.
2. Within ten (10) days of the effective date of this Order, Cheat Road shall submit for approval a proposed plan of corrective action and schedule, outlining action items and completion dates for how and when Cheat Road will achieve compliance with all terms and conditions of its WV/NPDES permit and pertinent laws and rules. The plan of corrective action shall make reference to WV/NPDES Permit No. WV0115924, Registration No. WVR102302, and Order No. 8226. The plan of corrective action shall be submitted to:

**WVDEP Environmental Inspector Supervisor
NW Regional Environmental Enforcement Office
2031 Pleasant Valley Road
Fairmont, WV 26554**

A copy of this plan shall be submitted to:

**Chief Inspector
Environmental Enforcement - Mail Code #031328
WVDEP
601 57th Street SE
Charleston, WV 25304**

Upon approval, the plan of corrective action and schedule shall be incorporated into and become part of this Order, as if fully set forth herein. Failure to submit an approvable plan of corrective action and schedule or failure to adhere to the approved schedule is a violation of this Order.

3. Within ten (10) days of the effective date of this Order, Cheat Road shall electronically submit an administratively complete application for WV/NPDES permit coverage for the regulated activity. Any questions regarding the application process shall be directed to WVDEP DWWM-Permitting Section at (304) 926-0495.
4. Because of Cheat Road's Legislative Rule and permit violations, Cheat Road shall be assessed a civil administrative penalty of five thousand fifty dollars (\$5,050) to be paid to the West Virginia Department of Environmental Protection for deposit in the Water Quality Management Fund within thirty (30) days of the effective date of this Order. Payments made pursuant to this paragraph are not tax-deductible for purposes of State or federal law. **Payment shall include a reference to the Order No. and shall be mailed to:**

**Chief Inspector
Environmental Enforcement - Mail Code #031328
WV-DEP
601 57th Street SE
Charleston, WV 25304**

OTHER PROVISIONS

1. Cheat Road hereby waives its right to appeal this Order under the provisions of Chapter 22, Article 11, Section 21 of the Code of West Virginia. Under this Order, Cheat Road agrees to take all actions required by the terms and conditions of this Order and consents to and will not contest the Director's jurisdiction regarding this Order. However, Cheat Road does not admit to any factual and legal determinations made by the Director and reserves all rights and defenses available regarding liability or responsibility in any proceedings regarding Cheat Road other than proceedings, administrative or civil, to enforce this Order.
2. The Director reserves the right to take further action if compliance with the terms and conditions of this Order does not adequately address the violations noted herein and reserves all rights and defenses which he may have pursuant to any legal authority, as well as the right to raise, as a basis for supporting such legal authority or defenses, facts other than those contained in the Findings of Fact.
3. If any event occurs which causes delay in the achievement of the requirements of this Order, Cheat Road shall have the burden of proving that the delay was caused by circumstances beyond its reasonable control which could not have been overcome by due diligence (i.e., force majeure). Force majeure shall not include delays caused or contributed to by the lack of sufficient funding. Within three (3) working days after Cheat Road becomes aware of such a delay, notification shall be provided to the Director/Chief Inspector and Cheat Road shall, within ten (10) working days of initial notification, submit a detailed written explanation of the anticipated length and cause of the delay, the measures taken and/or to be taken to prevent or minimize the delay, and a timetable by which Cheat Road intends to implement these measures. If the Director agrees that the delay has been or will be caused by circumstances beyond the reasonable control of Cheat Road (i.e., force majeure), the time for performance hereunder shall be extended for a period of time equal to the delay resulting from such circumstances. A force majeure amendment granted by the Director shall be considered a binding extension of this Order and of the requirements herein. The determination of the Director shall be final and not subject to appeal.
4. Compliance with the terms and conditions of this Order shall not in any way be construed as relieving Cheat Road of the obligation to comply with any applicable law, permit, other order, or any other requirement otherwise applicable. Violations of the terms and conditions of this Order may subject Cheat Road to additional penalties and injunctive relief in accordance with the applicable law.
5. The provisions of this Order are severable and should a court or board of competent jurisdiction declare any provisions to be invalid or unenforceable, all other provisions shall remain in full force and effect.
6. This Order is binding on Cheat Road, its successors and assigns.

7. This Order shall terminate upon Cheat Road's notification of full compliance with the "Order for Compliance" and verification of this notification by WVDEP.



David Biafora
Cheat Road, LLC.

5/25/15

Date

Public Notice begin:

Date

Public Notice end:

Date

Scott G. Mandirola, Director
Division of Water and Waste Management

Date

revised March 2013

RECEIVED

JUN 11 2015

ENVIRONMENTAL
ENFORCEMENT



PA011438

Silt fence not installed properly



PA011441

Boulders and sediment deposits originating from the site have entered waters of the State



PA011445

Boulders and sediment deposits originating from the site have entered waters of the State



PA011447

Boulders and sediment deposits originating from the site have entered waters of the State

Base Penalty Calculation

(pursuant to 47CSR1-6.1)

Responsible Party: Cheat Road, LLC Receiving Stream: West Run

Treatment System Design Maximum Flow: N/A MGD

Treatment System Actual Average Flow: N/A MGD (if known)

Enter FOF# and rate each finding as to Potential and Extent.

1)	Potential for Harm Factor	Factor Range	FOF#											
			2a	3a										
a)	Amount of Pollutant Released	1 to 3	1	1										
b)	Toxicity of Pollutant	0 to 3	1	1										
c)	Sensitivity of the Environment	0 to 3	1	1										
d)	Length of Time	1 to 3	1	1										
e)	Actual Exposure and Effects thereon	0 to 3	1	1										
Average Potential for Harm Factor			1	1	No									
2)	Extent of Deviation Factor	Factor Range												
	Degree of Non-Compliance	1 to 3	2	3										

Potential for Harm Factors:

- 1)c - Sensitivity of the Environment Potentially Affected (0 for "dead" stream)
- 1)d - Length of Time of Violation
- 1)e - Actual Human/Environmental Exposure and Resulting Effects thereon

Examples/Guidance:

Note: Rate as 1 for Minor, 2 for Moderate and 3 for Major. Rate as 0 if it does not apply.

Minor = exceedance of permit limit by <=40% for Avg. Monthly or <=100% for Daily Max., exceed numeric WQ standard by <= 100%, or report doesn't contain some minor information.

Moderate = exceedance of permit limit by >= 41% and <= 300% for Avg. Monthly , >= 101% and <= 600% for Daily Max., exceed numeric WQ standard by >= 101% and <= of 600% or report doesn't fully address intended subject matter.

Major = exceedance of permit limit by >= 301% for Avg. Monthly, >= 601% for Daily Max., exceed numeric WQ standard by >= 601%, failure to submit a report, failure to obtain a permit, failure to report a spill, etc. Note that a facility in SNC should be rated as major for length of time and degree of non-compliance.

Narrative WQ standard violations - case-by-case.

Penalty Adjustment Factors

(pursuant to 47CSR1-6.2)

Penalty Adjustment Factor

- 6.2.b.1 - Degree of or absence of willfulness and/or negligence - 0% to 30% increase
- 6.2.b.4 - Previous compliance/noncompliance history - 0% to 100% increase - based upon review of last three (3) years - Warning = maximum of 5% each, N.O.V. = maximum of 10% each, previous Order = maximum of 25% each - Consistent DMR violations for <1 year = 10% maximum, for >1 year but <2 years = 20% maximum, for >2 years but <3 years = 30% maximum, for >3 years = 40 % maximum
- 6.2.b.6 - Economic benefits derived by the responsible party (increase to be determined)
- 6.2.b.7 - Public Interest (increase to be determined)
- 6.2.b.8 - Loss of enjoyment of the environment (increase to be determined)
- 6.2.b.9 - Staff investigative costs (increase to be determined)
- 6.2.b.10 - Other factors

Size of Violator: 0 - 50% decrease

NOTE: This factor is not available to discharges that are causing a water quality violation. This factor does not apply to a commercial or industrial facility that employees or is part of a corporation that employees more than 100 individuals.

Avg. Daily WW Discharge Flow (gpd)	% Reduction Factor
< 5,000	50
5,000 to 9,999	40
10,000 to 19,999	30
20,000 to 29,999	20
30,000 to 39,999	10
40,000 to 99,999	5
> 100,000	0

Additional Other factors to be determined for increases or decreases on a case-by-case basis.

- Public Notice Costs (cost for newspaper advertisement)
- 6.2.b.2 - Good Faith - 10% decrease to 10% increase
- 6.2.b.3 - Cooperation with the Secretary - 0% to 10% decrease
- 6.2.b.5 - Ability to pay a civil penalty - 0% to 100% decrease

Base Penalty Adjustments

(pursuant to 47CSR1-6.2)

Penalty Adjustment Factor	% Increase	% Decrease	Base Penalty Adjustments
6.2.b.1 - Willfulness and/or negligence -	10		\$350
6.2.b.4 - Compliance/noncompliance history			\$0
6.2.b.6 - Economic benefits - (flat monetary increase)	\$1,170		\$1,170
6.2.b.7 - Public Interest - (flat monetary increase)			\$0
6.2.b.8 - Loss of enjoyment - (flat monetary increase)			\$0
6.2.b.9 - Investigative costs - (flat monetary increase)			\$0
6.2.b.10 - Other factors (size of violator)			\$0
6.2.b.10 - Additional Other Factors - Increase (flat monetary increase)			\$0
6.2.b.10 - Additional Other Factors - Decrease (flat monetary decrease)			\$0
Public Notice Costs (flat monetary increase)	\$30		\$30
6.2.b.2 - Good Faith - Increase			\$0
6.2.b.2 - Good Faith - Decrease			\$0
6.2.b.3 - Cooperation with the Secretary			\$0
6.2.b.5 - Ability to Pay			\$0
Penalty Adjustments			\$1,550
Penalty =			\$5,050

Estimated Economic Benefit Item	Estimated Benefit (\$)
Monitoring & Reporting	
Installation & Maintenance of Pollution Control Equipment	
O&M expenses and cost of equipment/materials needed for compliance	
Permit Application or Modification	\$1,170
Competitive Advantage	
Estimated Economic Benefit	\$1,170
Comments: Avoided cost of WV/NPDES permit application fee.	